# Simultaneous ocean acidification and warming do not alter the lipid-associated biochemistry but induce enzyme activities in an asterinid starfish 

Munawar Khalil ${ }^{\text {a,b,c,* }}$, Marleen Stuhr ${ }^{\text {a }}$, Andreas Kunzmann ${ }^{\text {a }}$, Hildegard Westphal ${ }^{\text {a,b }}$<br>${ }^{\text {a }}$ Leibniz Centre for Tropical Marine Research (ZMT), Fahrenheitstraße 6, 28359 Bremen, Germany<br>${ }^{\mathrm{b}}$ Faculty of Geosciences, University of Bremen, Klagenfurter Str. 2-4, 28359 Bremen, Germany<br>${ }^{\text {c }}$ Department of Marine Science, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Malikussaleh, Reuleut Main Campus, 24355 North Aceh, Indonesia

## H I G H L I G H T S

- Ocean acidification and warming impacts on tropical-subtropical asterinid starfish were investigated.
- Combined stressors did not affect starfish lipid and fatty acids.
- Ocean warming increased starfish total lipid, SFAs, and PUFAs but reduced MUFAs concentration.
- Elevated temperature allowed starfish to cope with the negative effect of increased $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ on enzyme activities.


## ARTICLE INFO

Editor: Olga Pantos

## Keywords:

Global ocean change
Multiple stressors
Asteroid
Lipid content
Fatty acid
Calcification-related enzyme

## G R A P H I C A L A B S T R A C T




#### Abstract

Ocean acidification and warming affect marine ecosystems from the molecular scale in organismal physiology to broad alterations of ecosystem functions. However, knowledge of their combined effects on tropical-subtropical intertidal species remains limited. Pushing the environmental range of marine species away from the optimum initiates stress impacting biochemical metabolic characteristics, with consequences on lipid-associated and enzyme biochemistry. This study investigates lipid-associated fatty acids (FAs) and enzyme activities involved in biomineralization of the tropical-subtropical starfish Aquilonastra yairi in response to projected near-future global change. The starfish were acclimatized to two temperature levels ( $27^{\circ} \mathrm{C}, 32^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ) crossed with three $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentrations ( $455 \mu \mathrm{~atm}, 1052 \mu \mathrm{~atm}, 2066 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ ). Total lipid ( $\Sigma \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}}$ ) and FAs composition were unaffected by combined elevated temperature and $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$, but at elevated temperature, there was an increase in $\mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}}$, SFAs (saturated FAs) and PUFAs (polyunsaturated FAs), and a decrease in MUFAs (monounsaturated FAs). However, temperature was the sole factor to significantly alter SFAs composition. Positive parabolic responses of CaATPase and Mg-ATPase enzyme activities were detected at $27^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ with elevated $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$, while stable enzyme activities were observed at $32^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ with elevated $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$. Our results indicate that the lipid-associated biochemistry of A. yairi is resilient and capable of coping with near-future ocean acidification and warming. However, the


[^0]https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2024.173000
Received 18 December 2023; Received in revised form 30 April 2024; Accepted 3 May 2024
Available online 6 May 2024
0048-9697/© 2024 The Authors. Published by Elsevier B.V. This is an open access article under the CC BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).
calcification-related enzymes Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase activity appear to be more sensitive to $p \mathrm{CO}_{2} / \mathrm{pH}$ changes, leading to vulnerability concerning the skeletal structure.

## 1. Introduction

Approximately $\approx 25 \%$ (mean uptake of $-2.7 \pm 0.3 \mathrm{Pg}$ C per year ${ }^{-1}, 1$ $\mathrm{Pg}=10^{15} \mathrm{~g}$ ) of the annual $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions are directly absorbed by the oceans (Gruber et al., 2023) and significantly alter seawater chemistry (i.e., reductions in pH and re-equilibration of carbonate systems), termed ocean acidification (OA) (Zeebe, 2012). These alterations leave an imprint on oceanic and coastal environments with potential impacts on the eco-physiology of marine organisms, especially calcifying species (Feely et al., 2004; Doney et al., 2012; Leung et al., 2022). Previous studies have shown that OA impacts physio-chemical aspects (i.e., behavior, reproduction, growth, development, survival, fitness, and metabolism) and skeletal mineralogical structures (i.e., biomineralization) of marine organisms (Kroeker et al., 2013; Dubois, 2014; Byrne and Fitzer, 2019; Melzner et al., 2020; Figuerola et al., 2021; Leung et al., 2022). Furthermore, the effects of OA on marine organisms can interact, often non-intuitively, with those of other environmental stressors, including ocean warming (OW) (Gao et al., 2020). OW alone is recognized to elicit detrimental consequences on vital biological processes of a wide range of marine organisms, with cascading effects on habitat structure and ecosystem functioning (Smale et al., 2019).

Among marine ecosystems, intertidal regions are predicted to experience the most significant impacts of OA and OW due to their exposure to high variability in temperature, pH , and direct anthropogenic drivers (Harley et al., 2006). This environmental volatility could expose marine intertidal organisms (e.g., anthozoa, asteroidea, bivalvia, and gastropoda) to conditions beyond the limits of their tolerance range, which may substantially impact their biological performance metrics (Byrne, 2011; Gao et al., 2020; Melzner et al., 2020). OA and OW can affect cellular and molecular processes that are physically reflected by an organism (Pörtner, 2008). Furthermore, OA and OW have been recognized to influence the intracellular ionic balance in calcifying organisms (Ramesh et al., 2017). Consequently, major reductions in biological performance and shifts in the organismal mode of life (i.e., active vs. passive) can follow, subsequently disrupting the trophic levels and causing further shifts in the food web system (Guinotte and Fabry, 2008; Pörtner, 2008).

As slow-moving intertidal echinoderms, asteroids (common name: starfish or sea stars, class asteroidea) are highly susceptible to abiotic and biotic changes in their habitat. Owing to their capacity as ectothermic animals with narrow tolerable to temperature alterations, asteroids are considered useful model organisms for global change studies focusing on the effects of OW and OA (Nguyen and Byrne, 2014; Lang et al., 2023). OA can narrow the thermal tolerance range, resulting in a higher susceptibility to extreme temperatures and reducing an organism's performance metrics, altering morphological structures, behavioral responses, and physiological processes (Pörtner, 2008; Walther et al., 2009; Schalkhausser et al., 2012). Furthermore, the asteroid endoskeleton is composed of high Mg-calcite ( $>4 \mathrm{wt} \% \mathrm{MgCO}_{3}$ (Weber, 1969; Dickson, 2002)); hence, it is more susceptible to dissolution under OA conditions (Dubois, 2014; Figuerola et al., 2021). Previous research has shown that interactive effects (additive or synergistic) of OA and OW in the asteroid class elevated the metabolic rate (Khalil et al., 2023), increased larval mortality (Byrne et al., 2013), produced larval developmental delay (Hue et al., 2022), behavioral modifications (McLaren and Byrne, 2022), modified coelomic fluid and coelomocytes (Wahltinez et al., 2023), and altered skeletal mineralogy (Khalil et al., 2022). On the contrary, other studies have found that some asteroids could benefit from combined OA and OW, showing increased growth (Gooding et al., 2009), and feeding enhancement (Kamya et al., 2016). However, the biochemical and physiological mechanisms underlying the phenotypic
response of asteroids to lower pH (high $\mathrm{pCO}_{2}$ ) and increased temperature remain unknown

Understanding how organisms might respond to combined OA and OW can be gained through laboratory experiments that expose organisms to manipulated levels of seawater $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ and temperature. While in recent years, abundant experiments have been carried out studying the effects of future environmental changes (e.g., elevated temperature, reduced pH , hypoxia, and changes in seawater $\mathrm{Mg}^{2+} / \mathrm{Ca}^{2+}$ ratio as a sole or combined stressor) on the physiological processes and skeletal production of echinoderm species (Smith et al., 2016; Byrne and Fitzer, 2019; Sampaio et al., 2021; Hu et al., 2022; Lang et al., 2023; AzcarateGarcia et al., 2024), we here examine how a tropical-subtropical asterinid starfish regulates its physiological performance in response to environmental stressors (OA and OW) by analyzing the composition of lipid-associated fatty acids (FAs) and the activities of enzymes typically involved in the calcification process. Lipids and associated FAs play a critical role in maintaining the functions of growth, metabolism, and buoyancy control; lipid-FAs are not only an essential factor for the fluidity of the plasma membrane but also a carrier for the preservation of material and energy in marine animals and serve as indicators of an organism's dietary pattern and bio-physiological condition (Dalsgaard et al., 2003; Zhukova, 2022). Marine organisms also utilize their lipids as a defense mechanism against the influence of environmental stressors or lipid peroxidation by restructuring FAs and sterols (isoprenoidderived lipids, e.g., cholesterol in animals) of the lipid bilayer to preserve the physical characteristics of biological membranes (Hazel and Williams, 1990; Parrish, 2013). FAs indicate biochemical alterations in response to organismal physiological stress conditions (Filimonova et al., 2016; Bennett et al., 2018), immunity (Gao et al., 2018), and inflammation (Calder, 2010). FAs contain carboxylic acids with long hydrocarbon chains of different lengths and saturation grades (classified by the number of double bonds), generally classified into saturated fatty acids (SFAs, no double bonds), monounsaturated fatty acids (MUFAs, one double bond per molecule) and polyunsaturated fatty acids (PUFAs, two or more double bonds per molecule) (IUPAC-IUB, 1977). Among these FA chains, PUFAs such as eicosapentaenoic acid (EPA; C20:5 $\omega 3$ ) and docosahexaenoic acid (DHA; C22:6 $\omega 3$ ) are FA compounds essential for growth, reproduction, and survival (Kattner et al., 2007), and are involved in maintaining cell structures and functions in marine organism (Filimonova et al., 2016).

It is well known from marine animals that FA compounds and membranes are influenced by environmental factors (Hazel and Williams, 1990; Hazel, 1995; Dalsgaard et al., 2003; Yoon et al., 2022), including temperature (e.g., elevated temperature significantly reduced PUFAs and increased SFAs concentration) (Valles-Regino et al., 2015; Garzke et al., 2016) and $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ (e.g., high levels of $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ increase SFAs and reduced PUFAs concentrations) (Rossoll et al., 2012). Increased ratios of PUFAs ( $\omega 6: \omega 3$ ) in animals indicate inflammation and physiological unhealth (Calder, 2010; Safuan et al., 2021). However, ectothermic animals are recognized to have the ability to counteract the effects of environmental stressors through an organism-specific physiological response termed homeoviscous adaptation (HVA) (Sinensky, 1974; Ernst et al., 2016). This adaptation process allows organisms to strengthen their cell membrane structure (i.e., PUFAs formation alters membrane fluidity and SFAs formation increases membrane stability) to avert membrane destabilization and maintain the functional state of cell membranes (Sinensky, 1974; Hazel, 1995; Ernst et al., 2016).

Enzymes play the main role as protein catalysts in most physiological processes to accelerate and regulate biochemical reactions (Hill et al., 2012). They are fundamental in the FA synthesis pathway (e.g., desaturation and elongation of FAs carbon chain) (Zhuang et al., 2022).

Furthermore, enzymes are the principal agents of physiological transformation in that they are responses to alterations in the external environment (Hill et al., 2012). Changes in enzyme activity under OA/ OW are reliable proxies to determine the resulting physiological-related process disruption (Donachy et al., 1989; Prazeres and Pandolfi, 2016), including biomineralization processes in calcifying organisms (Chave, 1984; Ivanina et al., 2020). Moreover, alterations in membrane-bound enzymes (e.g., Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase) are biomarker indicators of organismal stress, where the level of enzyme variation mirrors the impairment of physiological function that entails these enzyme systems (Vijayavel et al., 2007). Although studies have shown that OA or OW as sole stressors can significantly alter Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase activities in coral (Jiang et al., 2019) and foraminifera (Prazeres et al., 2015; Prazeres and Pandolfi, 2016), the interactive combined effects of OA and OW on asteroids remain largely unknown.

To address these knowledge gaps on FAs biochemical composition and enzyme activities (Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase) in asteroids, we performed a controlled laboratory experiment and investigated the longterm interactive effects of OA and OW for 90 days in the small asterinid starfish Aquilonastra yairi (Echinodermata: Asteroidea: Asterinidae). A. yairi is a nocturnal species that lives under rocks, reef structures, and in rubble areas; distributed from tropical to subtropical regions particularly in the eastern Mediterranean Sea, the Red Sea, and the Gulf of Suez (O'Loughlin and Rowe, 2006; Ebert, 2021). Our study provides insights into the physiological tolerance and resilience of $A$. yairi when exposed to near-future combined OA/OW conditions and supports our understanding of the consequences on their biological performance.

## 2. Methods

### 2.1. Experimental design and exposure conditions

Adult specimens of $A$. yairi were taken from stock cultured in the MAREE (Marine Experimental Ecology) facility of ZMT, Bremen, Germany ( 342 specimens: size $3-11 \mathrm{~mm}$ ) and were cleaned from debris. They were allowed to acclimate in a communal tank with recirculating artificial seawater (Red Sea Salt, Germany) to a temperature of $\approx 27^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ for seven days. Then, asteroids were randomly assigned to 18 experimental tanks (19 specimens in each tank) for a further seven-day acclimation period. During the acclimation period, no visible signs of stress were observed (i.e., discoloration and erratic flipping). Following acclimation, asteroids were exposed for 90 days to one of the six combinations of two temperature levels $\left(27^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\right.$ and $\left.32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\right)$ crossed with three concentrations of $\mathrm{pCO}_{2}(455 \mu \mathrm{~atm}, 1052 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$, and $2066 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ ), which represent factorial combinations of ambient environments and the forthcoming levels of changes in the temperature and $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ regime according to the IPCC-Representative Concentration Pathways (RCPs) 8.5 emission scenario for year 2100 (IPCC, 2014). Moreover, the ambient temperature ( $27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ) represents the summer mean sea surface temperature (SST) (June to October) in natural habitats of A. yairi (e.g., in the Gulf of Suez). Three replicate experimental tanks were set up for each treatment. Each experimental tank was independent of the others, with isolated chillers, heaters, and $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ systems. To prevent physiological shock, temperature and $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentration levels were ramped up over ten days. During experimental exposure, A. yairi was feeding on living diatoms that were allowed to grow on the walls of aquaria and deposited detritus flocs. The experimental conditions and design are described in detail in Khalil et al. (2022).

Seawater samples were periodically taken during experiments to assess the carbonate chemistry of the seawater. Briefly, $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$-free air and pure $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ gas were mixed with solenoid-valve mass flow controllers to generate gas mixtures that were formulated to the target $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ conditions, in compliance with the standard operating procedure (SOP) for ocean $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ measurements (Dickson et al., 2007). The resulting gas mixtures were then bubbled into each treatment group's seawater reservoirs using flexible microporous air stones and repeatedly pumped
into replicate tanks. A programmed thermostat was used to regulate a closed-circle heating system that maintained treatment tank temperatures. Water parameters (i.e., temperature, salinity, $\mathrm{pH}_{\mathrm{T}}$ (total scale), and $\mathrm{pH}_{\text {NBS }}$ scale) and water carbonate chemistries (total alkalinity $\left(A_{T}\right)$ and dissolved inorganic carbon $\left(C_{T}\right)$ ) were measured periodically, which were subsequently used to calculate the water carbonate system. Details of the seawater chemistry control and manipulation, seawater parameters, and carbonate chemistry for the experimental tanks are provided in Supplementary material (Supplementary text and Table S1) and Khalil et al. (2022).

### 2.2. Total lipid and fatty acids analysis

Three specimens from each of the six treatment tanks were collected after 30,60 , and 90 days. The specimens were snap-frozen by submerging them in liquid nitrogen, freeze-dried, and stored at $-80^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ until further analysis. Total lipid $\left(\Sigma L_{C}\right)$ was extracted and purified according to the methods described by Bligh and Dyer (1959). Briefly, to separate the lower chloroform phase containing lipids from the rest of the tissue, two purification cycles of a $2: 1$ chloroform/methanol solution and ultrapure water were performed. The upper phase of the homogenates was discarded after centrifugation ( 3500 rpm for 5 min ). $\Sigma \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}}$ was determined gravimetrically by drying and weighing a subsample and expressed in mg lipid per $g$ asteroids dry weight. The fatty acids of the asteroids were determined as fatty acid methyl esters (FAMEs) at the end of the experiment. The relative composition of 14-24 carbon chain FAs of each individual was determined by transmethylation of dry asteroids lipid samples by acid-catalyzed esterification with $1 \%$ sulfuric acid in methanol, incubated at $50{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ for 16 h , and extracted into FAMEs in accordance with methods from Christie (1998). FAMEs were analyzed and quantified using a flame ionization detector gas chromatograph (GC) (Agilent 7890B MSD 5977 GC-FID, USA), and the output chromatograph peaks were identified using an FA standard mixture (37component FAME, Supelco, Bellefonte PA) (Galloway et al., 2015). The FA profile of an individual was interpreted using a printed output chromatograph. To calculate the absolute concentration of each FA, the area of each FA was divided by the area of the internal FA standard. This value was multiplied by the internal FA standard concentration added at the beginning and normalized to their dry weight. Final concentrations of FA are expressed as $\mu \mathrm{g} \mathrm{mg}^{-1}$ of dry weight (DW).

### 2.3. Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase activity assays

For Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase activity assays, nine A. yairi specimens were collected from each of the treatment groups after 30, 60, and 90 days of incubation time. As for the lipid analysis, the specimens were snap-frozen, freeze-dried, and stored at $-80{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. The samples were thawed on ice and homogenized in $200 \mu \mathrm{~L}$ Tris buffer ( 500 mM sucrose, $150 \mathrm{mM} \mathrm{KCl}, 20 \mathrm{mM}$ Tris, 1 mM dithiothreitol, and 0.1 mM phenylmethylsulphonyl, pH 7.6). Homogenates were then centrifuged at $12,600 \mathrm{~g}$ for 15 min at $4^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. The supernatants were transferred to a new tube, and an aliquot of $50 \mu \mathrm{~L}$ was preserved for the determination of protein concentration determination using the Bradford assay (Bradford, 1976). Briefly, BioRad's Bradford micro-assays set on a 96-well flat bottom plate was adapted with a standard protein solution prepared using bovine $\gamma$-globulin ( $1 \mathrm{mg} \mathrm{mL}^{-1}$ ). In each well of the microplate, 10 $\mu \mathrm{L}$ of each sample was added along with $290 \mu \mathrm{~L}$ of Bradford reagent (Sigma-Aldrich, USA). After 15 min of agitation at 150 revs $\mathrm{min}^{-1}$, the absorbance was read at $600 \mathrm{\eta m}$ using an Absorbance Microplate Reader (Tecan, Switzerland). Protein concentrations were expressed in mg of protein $\mathrm{mL}^{-1}$.

Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase activities were measured according to protocols initially developed by Chan et al. (1986), Busacker and Chavin (1981) and modified by Prazeres et al. (2015). The working buffer for Ca-ATPase contained $80 \mathrm{mM} \mathrm{NaCl}, 20 \mathrm{mM}$ Tris-Base, 15 mM KCl , and $15 \mathrm{mM} \mathrm{CaCl}_{2}$. Mg-ATPase was measured using a similar working buffer,
where $\mathrm{MgCl}_{2}$ replaced $\mathrm{CaCl}_{2}$ at the same concentration, while the pH was adjusted to 8.1. The sample homogenates ( $20 \mu \mathrm{~L}$ ) were mixed with $250 \mu \mathrm{~L}$ of working buffer containing 1 mM ouabain. The reaction started with the addition of $30 \mu \mathrm{~L}$ ATP stock solution ( 3 mM ). Subsequently, the mixture was incubated at $30^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ for 30 min . The reaction was stopped by adding Malachite Green Reagent in a Phosphate Assay Kit (SigmaAldrich, USA). Three technical replicates were measured for each sample. The inorganic phosphate ( Pi ) released by enzyme activity was determined based on a colorimetric method (Fiske and Subbarow, 1925) using the Phosphate Assay Kit (Sigma-Aldrich, USA) and calculated using a standard curve constructed with 1 mM Pi standards (SigmaAldrich, USA). The Pi concentration in the reaction mixture on 96 -well microplates (Greiner Bio-One, Germany) was quantified at $620 \mathrm{\eta m}$ by using an Absorbance Microplate Reader (Tecan, Switzerland). Homogenization buffer was used as a blank control. Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase activities were normalized to the total protein content and are expressed as $\mu$ moles Pi mg protein ${ }^{-1} \min ^{-1}$.

### 2.4. Statistical analysis

All data manipulation, visualization, and statistical analysis were performed using the R programming language v. 4.3.2 (R Core Team, 2023). The Shapiro-Wilk statistic $W$ test (Shapiro and Wilk, 1965) combined with visual Q-Q plots and histograms was used to test the data for normality, while Levene's test was applied to check the homogeneity of variance (Levene, 1960), before statistical analysis was performed. When data were not normally distributed or indicated heteroskedasticity, we transformed our predictor variables to improve normality assumptions using 'bestNormalize' v.1.9.1 in the R-statistical package (Peterson, 2021). The effects of elevated temperature and $\mathrm{pCO}_{2}$ and their interaction on $\Sigma \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}}$ and enzyme activities (i.e., Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase) were analyzed using a two-way multifactorial analysis of covariance (ANCOVA) using 'car' v.3.1-2 R-statistical package (Fox and Weisberg, 2019), with temperature and $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ as fixed factors, while incubation time was treated as a continuous covariate. Subsequently, Tukey's honest significant difference (HSD) post hoc comparisons were used to detect the origin of variation for significant interactions. The magnitude of the effect sizes of the statistical models expressed as partial eta squared $\left(\eta p^{2}\right)$, are also specified.

OA/OW and their interaction effects on the asteroids fatty acids class (i.e., SFAs, MUFAs, and PUFAs) were analyzed using a two-way multivariate analysis of covariance (MANCOVA) in 'MASS' v.7.3-60 R-statistical package (Venables and Ripley, 2002) complemented with 'car' v.3.1-2 R-statistical package (Fox and Weisberg, 2019). Temperature levels and $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentrations (solely and combined) were treated as fixed factors, and incubation time was a covariate in this initial MANCOVA test. Following the MANCOVA test, a series of two-way ANCOVAs were performed on each of the response variables of the FA classes and continued with post hoc comparisons of Tukey's HSD to distinguish significant differences among treatments. In addition, principal component analysis (PCA) was performed to explore differences in FA classes between treatment groups and to identify those FAs that explain most of the variability in the data set, carried out using base R functions combined with the 'ggbiplot' v.0.55 R-package (Wickham, 2016) to visualize the PCA result. The results were considered statistically significant (moderate evidence of an effect) at alpha values of $p \leq 0.05$. All functional response figures were plotted using 'ggplot2' v. 3.4.4 (Wickham, 2016).

## 3. Results

### 3.1. Total lipid

Total lipid ( $\Sigma \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}}$ ) exhibited a linear decrease with increasing levels of $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ at ambient temperature ( $27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ). In contrast, at high temperature $\left(32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\right)$, elevated $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentrations resulted in a parabolic trend in
lipid content (Fig. 1). Under elevated $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}, \Sigma \mathrm{~L}_{\mathrm{C}}$ in $27^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ treatments (mean $\pm \mathrm{SE} ; 0.739 \pm 0.040 \mathrm{mg} \mathrm{g} \mathrm{g}^{-1} \mathrm{DW}$ ) was $20.08 \%$ higher than in $32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ treatments $\left(0.591 \pm 0.102 \mathrm{mg} \mathrm{g}^{-1} \mathrm{DW}\right)$. The highest lipid content occurred at $32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ and medium $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentration (1052 $\mu \mathrm{atm} ; 1.327 \pm$ $0.562 \mathrm{mg} \mathrm{g}{ }^{-1} \mathrm{DW}$ ), while low $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentration ( $455 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ ) at $32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ treatment produces the lowest lipid content $\left(0.652 \pm 0.096 \mathrm{mg} \mathrm{g}^{-1}\right.$ DW). The quantities of lipid content in $A$. yairi were not significantly affected by either elevated temperature (ANCOVA, $p>0.05$; Supplementary Table S2) or $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ (ANCOVA, $p>0.05$; Supplementary Table S2) as sole factor neither combined factors (ANCOVA, $p>0.05$; Supplementary Table S2), but showed differences between incubation time with higher lipid contents on day 90 compared to day 30 (ANCOVA, $F_{2,43}=4.85, p=0.02, \eta p^{2}=0.18$; Supplementary Table S2 and Table S4). $\Sigma \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}}$ exhibited a linear increase with incubation time, except for the $32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}: 2066 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ treatment where $\Sigma \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}}$ changed in a negative parabolic pattern (Supplementary Fig. S1).

### 3.2. Fatty acids composition

Saturated FAs ( $\% ~ \Sigma$ SFAs $=43.50 \%$ of total detected FAs $\left(\Sigma_{d} \mathrm{FAs}\right)$ ) were the most abundant components in all treatment groups (Table 1, Fig. 2, and Supplementary Fig. S2), with the exception of the $27^{\circ} \mathrm{C}: 455$ $\mu \mathrm{atm}$ treatment, followed by monounsaturated FAs (\% $\Sigma \mathrm{MUFAs}=31.81$ $\%$ of $\Sigma_{d} \mathrm{FAs}$ ), and polyunsaturated FAs ( $\% \Sigma$ PUFAs $=24.62 \%$ of $\Sigma_{d} \mathrm{FAs}$ ). Furthermore, A. yairi contained more omega-3 ( $\omega 3$; PUFAs C18:3 $\omega 3$, $\mathrm{C} 20: 5 \omega 3$, and $\mathrm{C} 22: 6 \omega 3=21.24 \%$ of $\Sigma_{d} \mathrm{FAs}$ ) than omega-6 ( $\omega 6$; PUFAs $\mathrm{C} 18: 2 \omega 6, \mathrm{C} 20: 2 \omega 6$, and $\mathrm{C} 20: 4 \omega 6=3.38 \%$ of $\Sigma_{d} \mathrm{FAs}$ ) in all treatment groups (Table 1). Overall, SFAs were the most dominant FA class in A. yairi, followed by MUFAs and PUFAs under all treatment conditions.

The FA compositions of $A$. yairi exposed to an elevated temperature of $32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(2362.63 \pm 37.41 \mu \mathrm{mg} \mathrm{m}^{-1} \mathrm{DW}\right)$ had a higher total FA composition compared to asteroids at an ambient temperature of $27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ( $2198.67 \pm 22.90 \mu \mathrm{~g} \mathrm{~g}^{-1} \mathrm{DW}$ ), reflecting the decrease in MUFAs and PUFAs at $27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}: 1052 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$, and $2066 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ treatments, including a strong decrease in MUFAs C16:1 $\omega 9$ and $\mathrm{C} 18: 1 \omega 7$, and PUFAs C18:2 $\omega 6$ and C20:5 03 (Table 1, Fig. 2, and Supplementary Fig. S2). FAs composition at high-temperature treatments increased in a parabolic pattern in response to elevated $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ (Fig. 2), with the highest intensification observed at $32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}: 1052 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ for all FA classes (SFAs, MUFAs, and PUFAs; Table 1). Furthermore, SFAs (mean) exhibited an increase at high-temperature and elevated $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ treatments $\left(32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}: 1052 \mu \mathrm{~atm}\right.$ and $2066 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ ) compared to ambient temperature and low- $\mathrm{pCO}_{2}$ treatment ( $27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ : $455 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ ), whereas MUFAs (mean) reveal a decreased with elevated $\mathrm{pCO}_{2}$ in all temperature treatment groups (Fig. 2 and Supplementary Fig. S2). It is noticed that the concentration of PUFA C18:3 $\omega 3$ (ALA) in high $\mathrm{pCO}_{2}$ (2066 $\mu \mathrm{atm}$ ) at both temperature treatments declined to close to zero (Table 1). EPA:DHA ratio decreased with increasing temperature from ca $8.61: 1$ to $7.47: 1$ (Table 1).

A PCA on the entire FAs composition data set provided a twodimensional pattern (Fig. 3), which explained $65.1 \%$ of the total variance. Principal component PC1 explained 52.7 \% of the FAs variability, with the majority of the contribution from FSAs (C20:0, C18:0, C16:0, C14:0, C22:0), MUFAs (C16:1 $\omega 9$, C18:1 $\omega 7$, C18:1 $\omega 7, \mathrm{C} 20: 1 \omega 9$ ), and PUFAs (C20:5 $\omega 3$, C20:2 $\omega 6$ ). PUFAs C18:2 $\omega 6$, C18:3 $\omega 3$, C $20: 2 \omega 6$, and C20:5 $\omega 3$ contributed the most to the principal component PC2, followed by MUFA C22:1 $\omega 9$ and SFA C24:0 which explained $12.4 \%$ of the variability in the FAs composition. The $95 \%$ confidence interval ellipses of PCA showed no separation between the treatment groups. Furthermore, the PCA showed that there were no notable variations in FAs composition between the six treatment groups.

There was no significant effect of $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ as the sole factor in FA compositions or combined factor with temperature (MANCOVA, $p>$ 0.05; Supplementary Table S3). Nonetheless, temperature was the only sole factor found to affect SFAs significantly (MANCOVA, $F_{1,6}=365.84$, $p=0.04$; Supplementary Table S3), but found not significantly to affect other FA classes (MANCOVA, $p>0.05$; Supplementary Table S3). FA


Fig. 1. Total lipid ( $\mathrm{mg} \mathrm{g}^{-1} \mathrm{DW}$ ) of A. yairi (shown in the upper left corner) for 90 days of exposure to different temperature levels ( $27^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$, $32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ) and $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentrations ( $455 \mu \mathrm{~atm}, 1052 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$, and $2066 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ ). Boxplots display the mean effect in each treatment (black dots), median (horizontal solid bar inside the box), interquartile (upper and lower horizontal lines of the box), and $1.5 \times$ interquartile ranges (whiskers). Vertical dark-green bars denote $95 \%$ confidence intervals of $\Sigma \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}}$ values; $n=54$.
classes showed no significant alter by incubation time in all treatment groups (MANCOVA, $p>0.05$; Supplementary Table S3). Subsequent ANCOVA analyses for each of the three FAs classes revealed statistically significant effects of incubation time on SFA C16:0 (ANCOVA, $F_{2,39}=$ 6.06, $p=0.01, \eta p^{2}=0.24$; Supplementary Tables S2 and S4) and PUFA C20:5 03 (ANCOVA, $F_{2,29}=3.45, p=0.05, \eta p^{2}=0.19$; Supplementary Tables S2 and S4), while temperature as the sole factor observed significantly affected SFA C18:0 (ANCOVA, $F_{1,29}=5.19, p=0.03, \eta p^{2}=$ 0.19; Supplementary Tables S2 and S4) only. However, $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ as the sole or combined factor with temperature did not affect any FAs profile in all treatment groups (ANCOVA, $p>0.05$; Supplementary Table S2). Furthermore, the $\omega 3: \omega 6$ ratio was found not to change significantly affect by any factor (ANCOVA, $p>0.05$; Supplementary Table S2).

### 3.3. Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase activities

Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase activities exhibited a positive parabolic response pattern to increasing $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ at ambient temperature $\left(27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\right)$ treatment, whereas enzyme activity shows a stable pattern in response to increasing $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ at high temperature ( $32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ) (Fig. 4). The highest CaATPase activity (mean $\pm \mathrm{SE} ; 0.73 \pm 0.03 \mu$ moles Pi mg protein ${ }^{-1} \mathrm{~min}^{-1}$ ) was observed under ambient temperature and low $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentration ( $455 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ ), and the lowest value ( $0.59 \pm 0.02 \mu$ moles Pi mg protein ${ }^{-1}$ $\min ^{-1}$ ) at ambient temperature and medium $\mathrm{pCO}_{2}$ concentration (1052 $\mu \mathrm{atm})$ condition. Ca-ATPase activity was significantly affected by incubation time, where Ca-ATPase activity showed a significant decrease as incubation time progressed with exception of $27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ : $1055 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ (ANCOVA, $F_{2,151}=27.96, p=0.00, \eta p^{2}=0.27$; Supplementary Table S2, Table S4, and Fig. S3a), $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentration (ANCOVA, $F_{2,151}$ $=4.02, p=0.02, \eta p^{2}=0.05$; Fig. 4a, Supplementary Table S2 and Table S4) and by the interaction of the factors temperature and $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ (ANCOVA, $F_{2,151}=6.01, p=0.00, \eta p^{2}=0.07$; Supplementary Table S2 and Table S4), but not by temperature (ANCOVA, $p>0.05$;

Supplementary Table S2).
Similarly, Mg-ATPase activity was also significantly affected by the combined factors of temperature and $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ (ANCOVA, $F_{2,151}=7.75, p=$ $0.00, \eta p^{2}=0.09$; Fig. 4b, Supplementary Table S2 and Table S4), as well as by the sole factor of $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ (ANCOVA, $F_{2,151}=3.92, p=0.02, \eta p^{2}=$ 0.05 ; Supplementary Table S2 and Table S4) and incubation time (ANCOVA, $F_{2,151}=25.62, p=0.00, \eta p^{2}=0.25$; Supplementary Table S2 and Table S4). However, temperature as the sole factor was found to not significantly affect Mg-ATPase activity in A. yairi (ANCOVA, $p>0.05$; Supplementary Table S2). Furthermore, the highest Mg-ATPase activity was observed in $27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ : $456 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ treatment, whereas the lowest was found in $27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ : $1052 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$. Apparently, Mg-ATPase activity decreased over incubation time, except for the $27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}: 1052 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ treatment with a negative parabolic pattern (Supplementary Fig. S3b).

## 4. Discussion

### 4.1. Lipid-associated resilience and homeoviscous adaptations

Assessing lipid and associated FAs allows defining the metabolic status, oxidative stress, potential energy provision, cell remediation, developmental potential, and reproductive capacity of an organism (Stanley-Samuelson, 1987; Murphy, 2001). Our results show that increased $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentration and temperature level as a sole stressor or combined stressors do not significantly affect the total lipid content ( $\Sigma \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}}$ ) of $A$. yairi. They imply that this asterinid species is relatively robust against conditions predicted in future global change scenarios. A possible explanation for the absence of significant changes in asteroid $\Sigma \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}}$ in response to elevated temperature and $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ was their retention of foraging capacity and feeding performance under stressful conditions (Gooding et al., 2009); hence, the lipid generation and conservation mechanism could remain functional. Furthermore, tropical-subtropical marine organisms are less exposed to seasonal diet pulses and have

Table 1
Total lipid and fatty acids composition of A. yairi reared under different temperature levels ( $27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}, 32^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ) and $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentrations ( $455 \mu \mathrm{~atm}, 1052 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$, and 2066 $\mu \mathrm{atm}$ ). Total lipid is expressed as $\mathrm{mg} \mathrm{g}^{-1}$ (mean $\pm \mathrm{SE}$ ) of asteroids tissue dry weight (DW). FAs are expressed as $\mu \mathrm{g} \mathrm{mg}^{-1}$ (mean $\pm$ SE) of asteroids tissue DW.

| Lipid ( $\mathrm{mg} \mathrm{g}^{-1} \mathrm{DW}$ ) and fatty acids ( $\mu \mathrm{g} \mathrm{mg}{ }^{-1} \mathrm{DW}$ ) profile | Temperature: $27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ |  |  | Temperature: $32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $\mathrm{pCO}_{2}: 455 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ | $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}: 1052 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ | $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}: 2066 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ | $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}: 455 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ | $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}: 1052 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ | $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}: 2066 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ |
| Lipid content |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\Sigma \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}}$ (total lipid) | $0.819 \pm 0.144$ | $0.790 \pm 0.215$ | $0.689 \pm 0.255$ | $0.561 \pm 0.096$ | $0.780 \pm 0.146$ | $0.431 \pm 0.067$ |
| Saturated fatty acids (SFAs) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| C14:0 (myristic acid) | $33.951 \pm 8.349$ | $21.664 \pm 4.777$ | $29.336 \pm 7.308$ | $22.794 \pm 5.978$ | $37.598 \pm 7.772$ | $34.765 \pm 13.073$ |
| C16:0 (palmitic acid) | $\begin{aligned} & 158.177 \pm \\ & 42.055 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 116.436 \pm \\ & 26.763 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 164.601 \pm \\ & 58.930 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 126.428 \pm \\ & 26.863 \end{aligned}$ | $220.231 \pm$ $38.858$ | $\begin{aligned} & 140.754 \pm \\ & 27.394 \end{aligned}$ |
| C18:0 (stearic acid) | $96.067 \pm 39.108$ | $\begin{aligned} & 130.907 \pm \\ & 24.849 \end{aligned}$ | $89.930 \pm 8.192$ | $\begin{aligned} & 126.056 \pm \\ & 21.900 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 167.943 \pm \\ & 35.030 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 151.656 \pm \\ & 28.139 \end{aligned}$ |
| C20:0 (arachidic acid) | $8.166 \pm 1.756$ | $7.110 \pm 1.735$ | $9.409 \pm 3.769$ | $6.460 \pm 1.201$ | $12.793 \pm 2.381$ | $8.335 \pm 1.877$ |
| C22:0 (behenic acid) | $11.936 \pm 2.672$ | $9.080 \pm 2.461$ | $9.426 \pm 3.768$ | $9.077 \pm 1.772$ | $11.741 \pm 3.650$ | $11.318 \pm 3.124$ |
| C24:0 (lignoceric acid) | $20.086 \pm 1.894$ | $24.359 \pm 3.796$ | $19.606 \pm 2.111$ | $23.600 \pm 5.575$ | $22.408 \pm 5.374$ | $26.593 \pm 8.162$ |
| Monounsaturated fatty acids (MUFAs) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\mathrm{C} 14: 1 \omega 5$ (myristoleic acid) | $1.273 \pm 0.350$ | $0.410 \pm 0.226$ | $1.057 \pm 0.338$ | $1.275 \pm 0.657$ | $0.489 \pm 0.235$ | $1.372 \pm 0.539$ |
| C16:1 $\omega$ 9 (palmitoleic acid) | $\begin{aligned} & 147.920 \pm \\ & 52.933 \end{aligned}$ | $79.149 \pm 24.489$ | $63.579 \pm 10.241$ | $61.512 \pm 21.641$ | $\begin{aligned} & 120.378 \pm \\ & 34.358 \end{aligned}$ | $46.091 \pm 12.424$ |
| C18:1 $\omega 9$ (oleic acid) | $22.467 \pm 8.341$ | $26.892 \pm 12.687$ | $43.533 \pm 19.549$ | $21.538 \pm 4.703$ | $32.295 \pm 5.261$ | $22.141 \pm 4.685$ |
| C18:1 $\omega 7$ (vaccenic acid) | $\begin{aligned} & 163.476 \pm \\ & 41.671 \end{aligned}$ | $90.653 \pm 17.174$ | $\begin{aligned} & 110.357 \pm \\ & 29.423 \end{aligned}$ | $78.131 \pm 17.304$ | $\begin{aligned} & 134.293 \pm \\ & 47.998 \end{aligned}$ | $96.548 \pm 28.360$ |
| $\mathrm{C} 20: 1 \omega 9$ (gondoic acid) | $11.605 \pm 2.614$ | $13.559 \pm 5.891$ | $12.744 \pm 7.125$ | $11.294 \pm 2.604$ | $21.905 \pm 8.873$ | $16.205 \pm 3.774$ |
| $\mathrm{C} 22: 1 \omega 9$ (erucic acid) | $0.054 \pm 0.054$ | $0.195 \pm 0.195$ | $0.211 \pm 0.141$ | $0.000 \pm 0.000$ | $0.000 \pm 0.000$ | $0.000 \pm 0.000$ |
| Polyunsaturated fatty acids (PUFAs) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| C18:206 (linoleic acid, LA) | $4.920 \pm 4.657$ | $2.863 \pm 2.250$ | $0.000 \pm 0.000$ | $15.610 \pm 5.486$ | $3.375 \pm 3.375$ | $8.124 \pm 3.731$ |
| C18:303 ( $\alpha$-linolenic acid, ALA) | $0.929 \pm 0.929$ | $1.450 \pm 0.950$ | $0.000 \pm 0.000$ | $3.185 \pm 1.763$ | $0.000 \pm 0.000$ | $0.000 \pm 0.000$ |
| C20:206 (eicosadienoic acid) | $5.529 \pm 0.938$ | $4.017 \pm 0.667$ | $9.202 \pm 4.425$ | $10.381 \pm 3.112$ | $7.191 \pm 1.968$ | $8.360 \pm 1.498$ |
| C20:406 (arachidonic acid, AA) | $10.370 \pm 3.247$ | $9.563 \pm 3.897$ | $9.090 \pm 5.129$ | $15.184 \pm 4.967$ | $13.884 \pm 4.845$ | $16.522 \pm 7.814$ |
| C20:5 03 (eicosapentaenoic acid, EPA) | $\begin{aligned} & 153.044 \pm \\ & 54.857 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 143.242 \pm \\ & 29.017 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 112.185 \pm \\ & 23.199 \end{aligned}$ | $69.901 \pm 16.069$ | $\begin{aligned} & 294.261 \pm \\ & 24.507 \end{aligned}$ | $83.323 \pm 32.343$ |
| C22:6 3 (docosahexaenoic acid, DHA) | $8.821 \pm 2.640$ | $20.431 \pm 7.753$ | $18.139 \pm 9.174$ | $15.914 \pm 7.676$ | $27.689 \pm 6.617$ | $16.309 \pm 6.696$ |
| Fatty acids (FAs) indices |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ESFAs | $\begin{aligned} & 308.297 \pm \\ & 28.811 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 285.196 \pm \\ & 27.412 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 302.703 \pm \\ & 29.911 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 290.815 \pm \\ & 27.931 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 450.306 \pm \\ & 43.512 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 346.827 \pm \\ & 31.749 \end{aligned}$ |
| EMUFAs | $\begin{aligned} & 346.741 \pm \\ & 31.199 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 210.664 \pm \\ & 16.309 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 231.270 \pm \\ & 17.653 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 173.750 \pm \\ & 13.478 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 309.360 \pm \\ & 24.561 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 182.356 \pm \\ & 14.898 \end{aligned}$ |
| $\Sigma$ SUFAs | $\begin{aligned} & 183.613 \pm \\ & 24.525 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 181.567 \pm \\ & 22.774 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 148.617 \pm \\ & 17.702 \end{aligned}$ | $130.174 \pm 9.844$ | $\begin{aligned} & 346.400 \pm \\ & 47.474 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 132.638 \pm \\ & 11.024 \end{aligned}$ |
| $\Sigma \omega 3$ | $\begin{aligned} & 226.409 \pm \\ & 17.135 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 209.600 \pm \\ & 10.568 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 157.673 \pm \\ & 10.193 \end{aligned}$ | $108.284 \pm 8.284$ | $321.950 \pm 7.781$ | $99.632 \pm 9.760$ |
| $\Sigma \omega 6$ | $20.819 \pm 2.947$ | $16.443 \pm 2.271$ | $23.533 \pm 4.932$ | $41.175 \pm 4.522$ | $24.449 \pm 3.396$ | $33.006 \pm 4.348$ |
| $\Sigma \omega 3: \Sigma \omega 6$ | 7.82:1 | 10.04:1 | 7.13:1 | 2.16:1 | 13.17:1 | 3.02:1 |
| EPA:DHA | 17.35:1 | 7.011:1 | 6.19:1 | 4.39:1 | 10.63:1 | 5.11:1 |

$\Sigma$ SFAs: sum of SFAs, $\Sigma$ MUFAs: sum of MUFAs, $\Sigma$ PUFAs: sum of PUFAs, $\omega 3$ : omega-3, $\omega 6$ : omega- $6, \Sigma \omega 3: \Sigma \omega 6$ : ratio of omega-3 ( $\omega 3$ ) fatty acids to omega- 6 ( $\omega 6$ ) fatty acids, EPA:DHA: ratio of eicosapentaenoic acid (EPA) to docosahexaenoic acid (DHA).
faster metabolic rates (Brett et al., 2009), which allows them to control relative lipid levels and subsequently use it rapidly to cope with environmental stressors. Lipids and bioaccumulation of minerals obtained by consuming microalgae (e.g., diatoms and microbial mats) are required continuously throughout the diet to support physiological development and maintain health and fitness (Kainz and Fisk, 2009). Additionally, a higher $\Sigma \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}}$ (in mean) was observed at higher temperatures and medium $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentration treatment ( $32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}: 1052 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ ), implying that the starfish could have enhanced its biosynthetic capacity to convert non-lipid molecules into lipids in such environmental settings. Future studies should thus verify this in manipulative trials with fully controlled diets.

The lipid sensitivities to OA and OW as sole or combined stressors in marine invertebrates show different scales, varying from functional adaptability (positive effects) to specific physiological losses (negative effects). Our findings concur with earlier research demonstrating that marine invertebrate species exposed to elevated $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ and temperature levels (as sole or combined factors) did not exhibit alterations in their
lipids content, e.g., sea urchin Strongylocentrotus purpuratus (Matson et al., 2012), sponges Carteriospongia foliascens, Cymbastela coralliophila, Rhopaloeides odorabile and Stylissa flabelliformis (Bennett et al., 2018), and the corals Porites spp. and Acropora millepora (Strahl et al., 2016). In contrast, other studies have found alterations in the organismal lipid content in response to OA and OW, e.g., Caribbean coral A. cervicornis ( $\Sigma \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}} \uparrow$; $\mathrm{OA}^{*}$ ) (Towle et al., 2015), scallop Crassadoma gigantea ( $\Sigma \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}} \uparrow$; OA*) (Alma et al., 2020), blue mussel Mytilus edulis ( $\Sigma \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}} \uparrow$; OW*) (Matoo et al., 2021), Arctic pteropod Limacina helicina ( $\Sigma \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}} \downarrow$; OA:OW*) (Lischka et al., 2022), oyster Crassostrea virginica ( $\Sigma \mathrm{L}_{\mathrm{C}} \downarrow$; OA*) (Schwaner et al., 2023). These differences in responses indicate that the sensitivity is species-specific and probably highly dependent on geographic distribution, habitat, physiological acclimation capacity, stressor intensity, and life history of species.

In addition to their significance in energy conservation, fatty acids are involved in numerous essential cellular functions, most notably through their function as building blocks of cell membranes. Essential FAs are also recognized as key determinants of ecosystem health and


Fig. 2. Fatty acids composition of asteroid A. yairi exposed to different temperature levels ( $27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}, 32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ) and $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentrations ( $455 \mu \mathrm{~atm}, 1052 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$, and 2066 $\mu \mathrm{atm}$ ) for 90 days of incubation time. Boxplots display the mean effect in each treatment (color dots), median (horizontal solid bar inside the box), interquartile (upper and lower horizontal lines of the box), and $1.5 \times$ interquartile ranges (whiskers). Vertical dark-green bars denote $95 \%$ confidence intervals of fatty acids. Letters designate significant differences between the temperature treatment ( $p<0.05$ ); $n=54$.


Fig. 3. Biplot of principal component analysis (PCA) based on fatty acid profiles ( $n=18$ classes) for asteroid A. yairi exposed to different temperature levels ( $27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$, $32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ) and $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentrations ( $455 \mu \mathrm{~atm}, 1052 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$, and $2066 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ ) for 90 days of incubation time; $n=54$. Individual samples are color-coded according to the treatment level. The plot is shown with $95 \%$ confidence ellipses.


Fig. 4. Enzyme activities of asteroid A. yairi exposed to different temperature levels ( $27^{\circ} \mathrm{C}, 32^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ) and $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentrations ( $455 \mu \mathrm{~atm}, 1052 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$, and $2066 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ ) for 90 days of incubation time; (a) Ca-ATPase ( $\mu$ moles Pi mg protein ${ }^{-1} \mathrm{~min}^{-1}$ ), and (b) Mg-ATPase ( $\mu$ moles Pi mg protein ${ }^{-1} \mathrm{~min}^{-1}$ ). Boxplots display the mean effect in each treatment (black dots), median (horizontal solid bar inside the box), interquartile (upper and lower horizontal lines of the box), and $1.5 \times$ interquartile ranges (whiskers). Vertical dark-green bars denote $95 \%$ confidence intervals of enzyme activity values. Letters designate significant differences between the treatment groups (Tukey's HSD, $p<0.05$ ); $n=53$.
stability (Parrish, 2013). Overall, elevated water temperature exerted a larger effect on the FA compositions relative to acidification. Our results showed that under future ocean scenarios, the temperature (as the sole stressor) affects the composition of asteroid FAs, where the FAs composition becomes more saturated during elevated temperature acclimation (i.e., SFAs increase in the negative parabolic pattern). This result is consistent with previous studies in other marine invertebrate species, such as sea cucumber Apostichopus japonicus (Yu et al., 2016), copepod Paracalanus sp. (Garzke et al., 2016), gastropod Dicathais orbita (Valles-Regino et al., 2015), and shrimp Palaemon elegans (Maia et al., 2022).

Temperature appears to contribute to increasing the amount of all SFA classes, with SFAs C18:0 alone found to have a statistically significant increase at high temperatures (ANCOVA, $p<0.05$ ). However, it seems that the effects of OA might quantitatively modify the impacts of temperature on asteroid SFAs composition. We suggest that the increased concentration of SFA under high-temperature environmental conditions is attributed to the enhanced allocation of SFA to cell membranes to preserve membrane stability and viscosity and is functional in counteracting the reduced internal cell pH due to acidification (Maia et al., 2022); where high temperature often leads to protein degeneration in the lipid bilayer of biomembranes, which generates a preponderance of membrane fluidity and increases membrane permeability (Hazel, 1995). Furthermore, SFA C16:0 is the final major by-product of FAs biosynthesis within the cell cytosol, serving as precursors for longchain de novo biosynthesis of both saturated and unsaturated FAs (Gurr et al., 2002). C16:0 is used as a lipid mediator for cell signaling, neuroprotective, anti-neuroinflammatory, and analgesic activities
(Carta et al., 2017). Increases in SFA C16:0 and C18:0 that were found in this study are suggested to represent a response mode to suppress physiological disorders resulting from elevated temperature beyond thermal optima; C16:0 and C18:0 are synthesized on-demand and exert their functions in loco during inflammations and neurodegenerative disorders to counteract inflammation and neuronal lesion. However, drastic increases in C16:0 and C18:0 could have adverse physiological consequences - apoptosis, oxidative stress, and endothelial dysfunction (Wang et al., 2007; Carta et al., 2017). Furthermore, SFAs are categorized as rapid energy resources, and their extraction could accelerate in response to OA/OW conditions to offset the higher energetic expenses associated with survival in a chronic environment (Garzke et al., 2016).

Although neither temperature nor $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ as a sole or combined factor lacked a statistically significant effect on MUFAs (MANCOVA, $p>0.05$ ), there was a decreasing trend in the MUFAs abundance as temperature$p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ increased markedly in MUFAs C16:1 $\omega 9$ and $\mathrm{C} 18: 1 \omega 7$. This might indicate thermal-acidity stress responses by the asteroid. MUFAs represent a highly catabolizable energetic resource (Tocher, 2010); thus, asteroids would probably metabolize them to yield energy to offset the energetic deficits that ensue due to increased energy expenditure for cell-physiological processes in parallel with thermoregulation during stressful conditions. Other physiological factors, e.g., development and reproduction under extreme environmental conditions, require immense energy expenditure (Doney et al., 2012), which might also contribute to depletion in MUFA stores. Decreased MUFA levels under warming and acidification conditions were recorded in the sponges C. foliascens, C. coralliophila, and S. flabelliformis (Bennett et al., 2018). Interestingly, however, MUFA palmitoleic acid (C16:1 $\omega 9$ ) at $32^{\circ} \mathrm{C}: 1052$
$\mu \mathrm{atm}$ was increased compared to $27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}: 455 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$. In this context, $\mathrm{C} 16: 1 \omega 9$ enhancement is suggested as a potential acclimation measure to diminish the inflammatory effects caused by elevated temperature, because animal and cell culture studies indicate that $\mathrm{C} 16: 1 \omega 9$ acts as an anti-inflammatory and reduces the adverse effects of higher SFA (de Souza et al., 2018).

Asteroid PUFAs did not significantly alter in response to changes in temperature and/or $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ (i.e., MANCOVA and ANCOVA statistical results). However, individuals reared at $27^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ contained less $\Sigma$ PUFAs than those reared at $32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. All PUFA classes were found to enhance as temperature increased, with a particular major increase observed in $\mathrm{C} 18: 2 \omega 6$ (linoleic acid) and C20:4 $\omega 6$ (arachidonic acid, AA) by $\approx 273 \%$ and $\approx 68 \%$, respectively. $\mathrm{pCO}_{2}$ concentrations most likely contributed to modifying the quantitative level of PUFA shifts in response to elevated temperature. These increased levels of PUFAs suggest that tropicalsubtropical asteroids are predicted to become more resilient and adaptable to current and future global ocean changes, where enhancement of PUFAs could be utilized to cope with the adverse physiological effects of stressors (Yoon et al., 2022). Relative enhancement of PUFAs $\omega 3$ and $\omega 6$ with increasing temperature arguably reflects physiological differences that may promote the resistance of this species to environmental stress (i.e., resilience to physiological stress) (Tocher, 2010; Filimonova et al., 2016). Increased PUFAs could be related to acclimation mechanisms to maintain membrane fluidity and permeability and subsequent cell homeostasis, regulate ion flux and thermoregulation in the encounter of environmental changes; besides, PUFAs play important roles in the reproductive process, neurological development, immune system, and serve as essential hormone precursors (i.e., for eicosanoids) (Stanley-Samuelson, 1987; Calder and Grimble, 2002; Zhukova, 2022). Asteroids acquire PUFAs from their diets; therefore, an increase in PUFAs may be related to feeding performances that are not affected by stressors. Moreover, elevated temperatures were found to increase feeding rates in some asteroids species (Gooding et al., 2009), leading to higher nutrition intake. The sources of PUFAs in asteroids diets are unclear, but it has been associated with microorganisms living in benthic habitats, e.g., macroalgae, specific diatom species, protozoa, and microeukaryotes (Howell et al., 2003). Furthermore, some marine invertebrates have the ability to directly synthesize PUFAs (e.g., $\mathrm{C} 20: 4 \omega 6, \mathrm{C} 20: 5 \omega 3$, and $\mathrm{C} 22: 6 \omega 3$ ) through the FA desaturation process (Nakamura and Nara, 2004; Yoon et al., 2022). However, further research is required to identify the potential desaturation process in asteroids for generating PUFAs. On the contrary, previous studies have shown that, mostly, marine invertebrates exposed to elevated temperatures as the sole factor or combined with $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ produce a reduction in $\Sigma$ PUFAs, e.g., sea cucumber A. japonicus (Yu et al., 2016), gastropod D. orbita (Valles-Regino et al., 2015), scallop C. gigantea (Alma et al., 2020), shrimp P. elegans (Maia et al., 2022), and hard coral A. digitifera (Safuan et al., 2021).

We noted a reduction in PUFA $\omega$ - 3 along with an enhancement of PUFA $\omega-6$ as temperature increases. This alteration is related to the lipid peroxidation activation mechanism in protecting membranes against oxidation damage induced by stressors. Temperature can modulate cell membrane structure by stimulating the lipid peroxidation pathway that initiates by reactive oxygen species (ROS) (Butow et al., 1998), in which membrane phospholipids (i.e., primarily PUFAs) are exposed to oxidative reactions by ROS. Higher lipid saturation and high $\mathrm{O}_{2}$ concentration lead to an increase in the velocity of the lipid radical chain reactions (Anacleto et al., 2014). PUFAs $\omega-3$ and $\omega-6$ are further employed to inhibit ROS through increasing macrophage phagocytosis capacity (Ambrozova et al., 2010). Furthermore, the PUFAs $\omega$-3: $\omega-6$ ratio is wellknown to significantly contribute to membrane functions and cellular processes, e.g., cell survivability (Schmitz and Ecker, 2008). Although PUFAs $\omega 3: \omega 6$ ratio was marginally significant (ANCOVA, $F_{1,41}=3.10, p$ $=0.09, \eta p^{2}=0.07$; Supplementary Table S2) affected by temperature as sole factor, PUFAs $\omega-3: \omega-6$ ratio was recoded to decrease from 8.25:1 at ambient temperature ( $27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ) to $5.18: 1$ after being exposed to high-
temperature $\left(32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\right)$ treatment for 90 days. The ratio shift suggests a switch of PUFAs regulation from the anti-inflammatory mode (more PUFAs $\omega$-3) to the pro-inflammatory mode (more PUFAs $\omega$-6) (Schmitz and Ecker, 2008). Inflammation plays an important role in systemic mechanisms of cellular defense and helps protect against harmful stimuli, e.g., immune responses, cell-tissue repair, and warning signals of physiological anomalies; however, prolonged or excessive inflammation can lead to tissue damage, organ dysfunction, and increased risk of various health problems (Calder and Grimble, 2002; Calder, 2010).

The present study reveals a potential acclimation mechanism of cell membrane remodeling homeoviscous adaptation in response to elevated seawater temperature (Hazel and Williams, 1990; Hazel, 1995). An increase in asteroid SFAs and PUFAs followed by a reduction in MUFAs and PUFAs $\omega-3: \omega-6$ ratio implied compensatory alterations in fluidity and permeability of cell membrane lipid bilayers to preserve membrane biophysical functions and properties under chronic environmental stress. Still, it remains obscure whether this biochemical acclimation strategy is viable under more prolonged durations and higher intensities of stressors. Moreover, further research is essential to assess the impacts of future ocean scenarios on asteroids larvae (produced by sexual reproductive mode) or 'juvenile' individuals (produced by fissiparous in asexual reproductive mode) since a higher vulnerability at the early developmental stage may pose barriers to species' survival in the continuously changing oceans.

### 4.2. Enzyme activities under multiple stressors and their potential role in calcification

Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase activities show susceptibility to changes in $\mathrm{pCO}_{2}$ and temperature. Statistical analysis indicated that the interaction of OA and OW significantly affected Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase activities; enzyme activities decreased with increasing temperature and $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentration, suggesting impaired adenosine triphosphate (ATP) production and enzyme function, resulting in reduced energy supplies needed to sustain the metabolic demands of routine maintenance. In addition to serving as energy storage for various physiological cellular processes (Sokolova et al., 2012; Petersen and Verkhratsky, 2016), ATP is an organic molecule that plays a vital role as a biochemical catalyst in physiological cellular processes, ion transporters or exchangers (e.g., $\mathrm{Ca}^{2+}$ and $\mathrm{Mg}^{2+}$ ) in the calcification process, and in the removal of excess protons $\left(\mathrm{H}^{+}\right)$from the biomineralization site for the skeleton (Ivanina et al., 2020). In ectothermic animals (e.g., echinoids), those bio-cellular processes involve high-energy utilization and intensive catalysts that are provided by ATP (Pan et al., 2015; Stumpp and $\mathrm{Hu}, 2017$ ). Studies of Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase activities under the influence of OA and OW as combined or single factors have yielded different and inconsistent responses. For instance, Ca-ATPase and MgATPase activities of the benthic foraminifera Amphistegina lessonii were enhanced after exposure to OA and OW for 30 days; however, Marginopora vertebralis had the opposite response (Prazeres et al., 2015). A finding similar to that of the present study was reported in the razor clam Sinonovacula constricta, where elevated $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ (decreased pH) suppressed $\mathrm{Ca}-\mathrm{Mg}$ ATPase activity after one week of exposure (Peng et al., 2017). Duration of exposure, stressor intensity, species-specific differences, experimental setups, and methodology appear to contribute to differences in the response of these important enzymes to OA/OW.

Our results showed different Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase activities between ambient ( $27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ) and high temperature ( $32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ) treatments in response to increasing $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentrations. Enzyme activity at ambient temperature displayed a positive parabolic curve in response to increased $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentrations, indicating a plasticity-physiological acclimation response to balance intracellular acid-base conditions due to changes in pH . Furthermore, lower enzyme activity at medium concentrations of $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ specified stress conditions, where asteroid lost their capacity to accelerate physiological enzyme activities due to disturbances of their energy balance in low-pH environments (Bisswanger,

2017; Khalil et al., 2023). The energy balance could be adversely influenced by OA both directly through the negative effects of lower extracellular and intracellular pH on energy metabolism and indirectly through increased energy expenditure for biomineralization and acidbase regulation processes (Sokolova et al., 2012). On the contrary, at high concentrations of $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}\left(27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}: 2066 \mu \mathrm{~atm}\right)$, asteroid increased enzyme activities to balance extra- and intracellular acid-base conditions to maintain optimal physio-chemical microenvironment conditions, thus ensuring fundamental asteroid component survival (very low mortality, see Khalil et al., 2023) in these chronic stress environments. Enhanced enzyme activity may allow asteroids to actively pump $\mathrm{H}^{+}$to maintain pH homeostasis in the extracellular calcifying fluid (ECF, $\mathrm{pH}_{\mathrm{CF}}$ ). Consequently, up-regulation of the $\mathrm{H}^{+}$pump under high OA renders more metabolic $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ produced by cell organelle-mitochondria, which subsequently aggravates calicoblastic cell acidosis, making $\mathrm{H}^{+}$ dissipation more arduous (Laurent et al., 2014; Melzner et al., 2020) and skeletons become more susceptible to dissolution (see Khalil et al. (2022) for the descriptions of skeletal dissolution of asteroids A. yairi under OA/OW). We thus suggest that this rapid acceleration would involve a high-energy demand that might result in a trade-off and temporal energy reallocation with other physiological functions (Sokolova et al., 2012; Khalil et al., 2023). Furthermore, increased enzyme activity may indicate increased $\mathrm{Ca}^{2+}$ and $\mathrm{Mg}^{2+}$ ion provision into the ECF to promote asteroids calcification under OA conditions (Khalil et al., 2022). However, increasing ion supply seems unable to counteract the adverse effects of OA, as evidenced by significantly decreased calcification rates (Khalil et al., 2022).

The opposite condition was observed in the high-temperature regime ( $32{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ), where Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase activities exhibited low-stable responses, although they were significantly reduced compared to the ambient temperature and low $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ concentrations ( $27{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ : $455 \mu \mathrm{~atm}$ ) treatment. Elevated temperature seems to allow A. yairi to cope with the negative effect of increased $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ (decreased seawater pH ) on enzyme activities (antagonistic interactive effects). High temperatures are likely to stimulate and stabilize enzyme activity by intensifying ATP synthesis and utilization during intracellular acid-base homeostasis. We suggest that elevated temperatures could accelerate enzyme activity by utilizing a high energy supply through optimum-efficiency metabolic pathways to counteract another stressor (i.e., elevated $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ ) (Somero, 1978), thus alleviating physiological stress and allowing asteroids to maintain other vital physiological-related functions (e.g., biomineralization).

Furthermore, we previously showed that the high-temperature treatment combined with elevated $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ resulted in a low-stable calcification rate in the asteroid A. yairi (see Khalil et al. (2023)), which was also reflected in enzyme activity. These identical characteristics represent a strong correlation between enzyme activity and the calcification process, indicating the role of Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase as crucial enzymes involved in the biomineralization process in asteroids, in addition to V-type $\mathrm{H}^{+}$-ATPase (Tresguerres, 2016), carbonic anhydrase (CA), and $\mathrm{Na}^{+} / \mathrm{K}^{+-}$ATPase (Pan et al., 2015; Ivanina et al., 2020) in echinoderm species. Biomineralization processes (e.g., calcification) are known to be influenced not only by environmental conditions such as pH and temperature or salinity, but also closely related to organic molecules and biochemical cellular compounds (e.g., protein and enzyme) (Ivanina et al., 2020). The process of $\mathrm{Ca}^{2+}$ and $\mathrm{Mg}^{2+}$ balance in echinoderm species through intracellular modulation via trans-membrane transporters was described in prior studies (Stumpp and Hu, 2017; Kolbuk et al., 2020); however, the enzymes involved in the process have not been elucidated. The present study has reflected on the roles of enzymes, specifically Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase, in the calcification process of echinoids. However, the physio-chemical mechanisms underlying this process remain unknown; hence, further studies are needed in this direction.

## 5. Conclusions

The impacts of concurrent ocean warming and acidification on lipid content, fatty acids composition, and calcification-related enzyme activities (Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase) of the asteroid A. yairi were investigated for the first time. Examining total lipid and associated FAs provides insight into how these tropical-subtropical asteroids utilize their energy resources under current and near-future global environmental changes. Under OA/OW conditions, A. yairi exhibits acclimation ability to maintain energy homeostasis presumably through efficient lipid-associate regulation and concurrently remodel membrane biophysics (e.g., membrane structure, fluidity, permeability, and functional properties) by adjusting their lipid-FAs biosynthesis, thereby, giving them potential compensatory mechanisms to adapt with changes in ocean temperature and pH (i.e., homeoviscous adaptation). Furthermore, elevated temperatures seem to confer a physiological benefit in maintaining enzyme activities that minimize the effects of reduced pH , indicating that Ca -ATPase and Mg -ATPase activities in asteroid species are temperature- and pH -dependent physiological functions. Collectively, the findings of this study provide insight into potential biochemical adaptation mechanisms utilized by the asteroid species A. yairi to cope with ongoing and impending global changes in ocean conditions, specifically OW and OA. However, it is important to note that different asteroid species may respond differently to OW/OA, depending on the magnitude and rate of environmental change, as well as interactions with other species and ecological processes.

## Funding

This research project was supported by the Leibniz Centre for Tropical Marine Research (ZMT) Academy-Doctoral Research Grant; the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research, and Technology, Republic of Indonesia-Asian Development Bank AKSI Project [grant number L3749INO] to MK.

## CRediT authorship contribution statement

Munawar Khalil: Conceptualization, Methodology, Investigation, Resources, Sample processing and analysis, Data curation, Formal analysis, Visualization, Writing - original draft, Writing - review \& editing, Funding acquisition. Marleen Stuhr: Methodology, Writing review \& editing. Andreas Kunzmann: Writing - review \& editing. Hildegard Westphal: Conceptualization, Methodology, Writing - review \& editing, Funding acquisition, Supervision.

## Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

## Data availability

The data that support the findings of this study are available at PANGAEA open access repository; data of total lipid: https://doi. pangaea.de/10.1594/PANGAEA. 965904 (Khalil et al., 2024c), fatty acid compositions: https://doi.pangaea.de/10.1594/PANGAEA. 965902 (Khalil et al., 2024b), and enzyme activities: https://doi.pangaea. de/10.1594/PANGAEA. 965905 (Khalil et al., 2024a).

## Acknowledgments

We are grateful to the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research, and Technology, Republic of Indonesia-Asian Development Bank AKSI Project for supporting MK with their doctoral scholarship program. We thank Silvia Hardenberg, José Garcia, and Nico Steinel of the ZMT

Marine Experimental Ecology Facility (MAREE) for providing support and technical assistance, and ZMT staff Matthias Birkicht, Fabian Hüge, Raika Himmelsbach, and Constanze von Waldthausen for their assistance in the ZMT chemistry and biology laboratories.

## Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data to this article can be found online at https://doi. org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2024.173000.

## References

Alma, L., Kram, K.E., Holtgrieve, G.W., Barbarino, A., Fiamengo, C.J., Padilla-Gamino, J. L., 2020. Ocean acidification and warming effects on the physiology, skeletal properties, and microbiome of the purple-hinge rock scallop. Comp. Biochem. Physiol. Part A Mol. Integr. Physiol. 240, 110579 https://doi.org/10.1016/j. cbpa.2019.110579.
Ambrozova, G., Pekarova, M., Lojek, A., 2010. Effect of polyunsaturated fatty acids on the reactive oxygen and nitrogen species production by raw 264.7 macrophages. Eur. J. Nutr. 49, 133-139. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00394-009-0057-3.
Anacleto, P., Maulvault, A.L., Bandarra, N.M., Repolho, T., Nunes, M.L., Rosa, R., Marques, A., 2014. Effect of warming on protein, glycogen and fatty acid content of native and invasive clams. Food Res. Int. 64, 439-445. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. foodres.2014.07.023.
Azcarate-Garcia, T., Avila, C., Figuerola, B., 2024. Skeletal Mg content in common echinoderm species from deception and Livingston Islands (South Shetland Islands, Antarctica) in the context of global change. Mar. Pollut. Bull. 199, 115956 https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2023.115956.
Bennett, H., Bell, J.J., Davy, S.K., Webster, N.S., Francis, D.S., 2018. Elucidating the sponge stress response; lipids and fatty acids can facilitate survival under future climate scenarios. Glob. Chang. Biol. 24, 3130-3144. https://doi.org/10.1111/ gcb. 14116.
Bisswanger, H., 2017. Enzyme Kinetics: Principles and Methods, 3rd ed. Wiley-VCH Verlag, Weinheim, Germany.
Bligh, E.G., Dyer, W.J., 1959. A rapid method of total lipid extraction and purification. Can. J. Biochem. Physiol. 37, 911-917. https://doi.org/10.1139/o59-099.
Bradford, M.M., 1976. A rapid and sensitive method for the quantitation of microgram quantities of protein utilizing the principle of protein-dye binding. Anal. Biochem. 72, 248-254. https://doi.org/10.1016/0003-2697(76)90527-3.
Brett, M.T., Müller-Navarra, D.C., Persson, J., 2009. Crustacean zooplankton fatty acid composition. In: Kainz, M., Brett, M., Arts, M. (Eds.), Lipids in Aquatic Ecosystems. Springer, New York, pp. 115-146.
Busacker, G.P., Chavin, W., 1981. Characterization of $\mathrm{Na}^{+}+\mathrm{K}^{+}$-ATPase and $\mathrm{Mg}^{2+}-$ ATPases from the gill and the kidney of the goldfish (Carassius auratus L.). Comp. Biochem. Physiol. Part B Biochem. Mol. Biol. 69, 249-256. https://doi.org/10.1016/ 0305-0491(81)90237-6.
Butow, B., Wynne, D., Sukenik, A., Hadas, O., Tel-Or, E., 1998. The synergistic effect of carbon concentration and high temperature on lipid peroxidation in Peridinium gatunense. J. Plankton Res. 20, 355-369. https://doi.org/10.1093/plankt/20.2.355.
Byrne, M., 2011. Impact of ocean warming and ocean acidification on marine invertebrate life history stages: vulnerabilities and potential for persistence in a changing ocean. In: Gibson, R.N., Atkinson, R.J.A., Gordon, J.D.M., Smith, I.P., Hughes, D.J. (Eds.), Oceanography and Marine Biology: An Annual Review. CRC Press, Boca Raton, pp. 1-42.
Byrne, M., Fitzer, S., 2019. The impact of environmental acidification on the microstructure and mechanical integrity of marine invertebrate skeletons. Conserv. Physiol. 7, coz062 https://doi.org/10.1093/conphys/coz062.
Byrne, M., Gonzalez-Bernat, M., Doo, S., Foo, S., Soars, N., Lamare, M., 2013. Effects of ocean warming and acidification on embryos and non-calcifying larvae of the invasive sea star Patiriella regularis. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 473, 235-246. https://doi. org/10.3354/meps10058.
Calder, P.C., 2010. Omega-3 fatty acids and inflammatory processes. Nutrients 2, 355-374. https://doi.org/10.3390/nu2030355.
Calder, P.C., Grimble, R.F., 2002. Polyunsaturated fatty acids, inflammation and immunity. Eur. J. Clin. Nutr. 56 (Suppl. 3), S14-S19. https://doi.org/10.1038/sj. ejen. 1601478.
Carta, G., Murru, E., Banni, S., Manca, C., 2017. Palmitic acid: physiological role, metabolism and nutritional implications. Front. Physiol. 8, 902. https://doi.org/ 10.3389/fphys.2017.00902.

Chan, K.-M., Delfert, D., Junger, K.D., 1986. A direct colorimetric assay for $\mathrm{Ca}^{2+}$ stimulated ATPase activity. Anal. Biochem. 157, 375-380. https://doi.org/10.1016/ 0003-2697(86)90640-8.
Chave, K.E., 1984. Physics and chemistry of biomineralization. Annu. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci. 12, 293-305. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.ea.12.050184.001453.
Christie, W.W., 1998. Gas chromatography-mass spectrometry methods for structural analysis of fatty acids. Lipids 33, 343-353. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11745-998-0214-x.
Dalsgaard, J., St. John, M., Kattner, G., Müller-Navarra, D., Hagen, W., 2003. Fatty acid trophic markers in the pelagic marine environment. In: Southward, A.J., Tyler, P.A., Young, C.M., Fuiman, L.A. (Eds.), Advances in Marine Biology. Academic Press, London, pp. 225-340.
de Souza, C.O., Vannice, G.K., Rosa Neto, J.C., Calder, P.C., 2018. Is palmitoleic acid a plausible nonpharmacological strategy to prevent or control chronic metabolic and inflammatory disorders? Mol. Nutr. Food Res. 62, 1700504 https://doi.org/ 10.1002/mnfr. 201700504.

Dickson, J.A., 2002. Fossil echinoderms as monitor of the $\mathrm{Mg} / \mathrm{Ca}$ ratio of Phanerozoic oceans. Science 298, 1222-1224. https://doi.org/10.1126/science. 1075882.
Dickson, A.G., Sabine, C.L., Christian, J.R. (Eds.), 2007. Guide to Best Practices for Ocean $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Measurements. PICES special publication, vol. 3. North Pacific Marine Science Organization, British Columbia, Canada.
Donachy, J.E., Watabet, N., Showman, R.M., 1989. $\mathrm{Na}^{+}$, $\mathrm{K}^{+}$-ATPase, $\mathrm{Mg}^{2+}$-ATPase and $\mathrm{Ca}^{2+}$-ATPase activity during arm regeneration in the starfish Asterias forbesi. Comp. Biochem. Physiol. Part A Mol. Integr. Physiol. 94, 57-60. https://doi.org/10.1016/ 0300-9629(89)90784-6.
Doney, S.C., Ruckelshaus, M., Duffy, J.E., Barry, J.P., Chan, F., English, C.A., Galindo, H. M., Grebmeier, J.M., Hollowed, A.B., Knowlton, N., Polovina, J., Rabalais, N.N., Sydeman, W.J., Talley, L.D., 2012. Climate change impacts on marine ecosystems. Ann. Rev. Mar. Sci. 4, 11-37. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-marine-041911111611.

Dubois, P., 2014. The skeleton of postmetamorphic echinoderms in a changing world. Biol. Bull. 226, 223-236. https://doi.org/10.1086/BBLv226n3p223.
Ebert, T.A., 2021. Life-history analysis of asterinid starfishes. Biol. Bull. 241, 231-242. https://doi.org/10.1086/716913.
Ernst, R., Ejsing, C.S., Antonny, B., 2016. Homeoviscous adaptation and the regulation of membrane lipids. J. Mol. Biol. 428, 4776-4791. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. jmb.2016.08.013.
Feely, R.A., Sabine, C.L., Lee, K., Berelson, W., Kleypas, J., Fabry, V.J., Millero, F.J., 2004. Impact of anthropogenic $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ on the $\mathrm{CaCO}_{3}$ system in the oceans. Science 305, 362-366. https://doi.org/10.1126/science. 1097329.
Figuerola, B., Hancock, A.M., Bax, N., Cummings, V.J., Downey, R., Griffiths, H.J., Smith, J., Stark, J.S., 2021. A review and meta-analysis of potential impacts of ocean acidification on marine calcifiers from the Southern Ocean. Front. Mar. Sci. 8, 584445 https://doi.org/10.3389/fmars.2021.584445.
Filimonova, V., Gonçalves, F., Marques, J.C., De Troch, M., Gonçalves, A.M.M., 2016. Fatty acid profiling as bioindicator of chemical stress in marine organisms: a review. Ecol. Indic. 67, 657-672. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2016.03.044.
Fiske, C.H., Subbarow, Y., 1925. The colorimetric determination of phosphorus. J. Biol. Chem. 66, 375-400. https://doi.org/10.1016/s0021-9258(18)84756-1.
Fox, J., Weisberg, S., 2019. An R Companion to Applied Regression, 3rd ed. Sage, Thousand Oaks, CA.
Galloway, A.W., Brett, M.T., Holtgrieve, G.W., Ward, E.J., Ballantyne, A.P., Burns, C.W., Kainz, M.J., Muller-Navarra, D.C., Persson, J., Ravet, J.L., Strandberg, U., Taipale, S. J., Alhgren, G., 2015. A fatty acid based bayesian approach for inferring diet in aquatic consumers. PloS One 10, e0129723. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal. pone. 0129723.
Gao, Y., Zheng, S.C., Zheng, C.Q., Shi, Y.C., Xie, X.L., Wang, K.J., Liu, H.P., 2018. The immune-related fatty acids are responsive to $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ driven seawater acidification in a crustacean brine shrimp Artemia sinica. Dev. Comp. Immunol. 81, 342-347. https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.dci.2017.12.022.
Gao, K., Gao, G., Wang, Y., Dupont, S., 2020. Impacts of ocean acidification under multiple stressors on typical organisms and ecological processes. Mar. Life Sci. Technol. 2, 279-291. https://doi.org/10.1007/s42995-020-00048-w.
Garzke, J., Hansen, T., Ismar, S.M., Sommer, U., 2016. Combined effects of ocean warming and acidification on copepod abundance, body size and fatty acid content. PloS One 11, e0155952. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0155952.
Gooding, R.A., Harley, C.D., Tang, E., 2009. Elevated water temperature and carbon dioxide concentration increase the growth of a keystone echinoderm. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A. 106, 9316-9321. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas. 0811143106.
Gruber, N., Bakker, D.C.E., DeVries, T., Gregor, L., Hauck, J., Landschützer, P., McKinley, G.A., Müller, J.D., 2023. Trends and variability in the ocean carbon sink. Nat. Rev. Earth Environ. 4, 119-134. https://doi.org/10.1038/s43017-022-00381-x.
Guinotte, J.M., Fabry, V.J., 2008. Ocean acidification and its potential effects on marine ecosystems. Ann. N. Y. Acad. Sci. 1134, 320-342. https://doi.org/10.1196/ annals.1439.013.
Gurr, M.I., Harwood, J.L., Frayn, K.N., 2002. Lipid Biochemistry, 5th ed. Blackwell Science, Oxford, UK.
Harley, C.D., Randall Hughes, A., Hultgren, K.M., Miner, B.G., Sorte, C.J., Thornber, C.S., Rodriguez, L.F., Tomanek, L., Williams, S.L., 2006. The impacts of climate change in coastal marine systems. Ecol. Lett. 9, 228-241. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.14610248.2005.00871.x.

Hazel, J.R., 1995. Thermal adaptation in biological membranes: is homeoviscous adaptation the explanation? Annu. Rev. Physiol. 57, 19-42. https://doi.org/ 10.1146/annurev.ph.57.030195.000315.

Hazel, J.R., Williams, E.E., 1990. The role of alterations in membrane lipid composition in enabling physiological adaptation of organisms to their physical environment. Prog. Lipid Res. 29, 167-227. https://doi.org/10.1016/0163-7827(90)90002-3.
Hill, R.W., Wyse, G.A., Anderson, M., 2012. Animal Physiology, 3rd ed. Sinauer Associates, Sunderland, MA.
Howell, K.L., Pond, D.W., Billett, D.S.M., Tyler, P.A., 2003. Feeding ecology of deep-sea seastars (Echinodermata: Asteroidea): a fatty-acid biomarker approach. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 255, 193-206. https://doi.org/10.3354/meps255193.
Hu, N., Bourdeau, P.E., Harlos, C., Liu, Y., Hollander, J., 2022. Meta-analysis reveals variance in tolerance to climate change across marine trophic levels. Sci. Total Environ. 827, 154244 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2022.154244.
Hue, T., Chateau, O., Lecellier, G., Marin, C., Coulombier, N., Le Dean, L., Gossuin, H., Adjeroud, M., Dumas, P., 2022. Impact of near-future ocean warming and acidification on the larval development of coral-eating starfish Acanthaster cf. solaris
after parental exposure. J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol. 548 https://doi.org/10.1016/j. jembe.2021.151685.
IPCC, 2014. Climate change 2014: Synthesis report. Contribution of working groups I, II and III to the fifth assessment report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. In: Core Writing Team, Pachauri, R.K., Meyer, L.A. (Eds.), The Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. IPCC, Geneva, Switzerland, p. 151.
IUPAC-IUB, 1977. IUPAC-IUB Commission on biochemical nomenclature (CBN). The nomenclature of lipids. Recommendations, 1976. Eur. J. Biochem. 79, 11-21. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1432-1033.1977.tb11778.x.
Ivanina, A.V., Jarrett, A., Bell, T., Rimkevicius, T., Beniash, E., Sokolova, I.M., 2020. Effects of seawater salinity and pH on cellular metabolism and enzyme activities in biomineralizing tissues of marine bivalves. Comp. Biochem. Physiol. Part A Mol. Integr. Physiol. 248, 110748 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cbpa.2020.110748.
Jiang, L., Guo, Y.J., Zhang, F., Zhang, Y.Y., McCook, L.J., Yuan, X.C., Lei, X.M., Zhou, G. W., Guo, M.L., Cai, L., Lian, J.S., Qian, P.Y., Huang, H., 2019. Diurnally fluctuating $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ modifies the physiological responses of coral recruits under ocean
acidification. Front. Physiol. 9, 1952. https://doi.org/10.3389/fphys.2018.01952.
Kainz, M.J., Fisk, A.T., 2009. Integrating lipids and contaminants in aquatic ecology and ecotoxicology. In: Kainz, M., Brett, M., Arts, M. (Eds.), Lipids in Aquatic Ecosystems. Springer, New York, pp. 93-114.
Kamya, P.Z., Byrne, M., Graba-Landry, A., Dworjanyn, S.A., 2016. Near-future ocean acidification enhances the feeding rate and development of the herbivorous juveniles of the crown-of-thorns starfish, Acanthaster planci. Coral Reefs 35, 1241-1251. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00338-016-1480-6.
Kattner, G., Hagen, W., Lee, R.F., Campbell, R., Deibel, D., Falk-Petersen, S., Graeve, M., Hansen, B.W., Hirche, H.J., Jónasdóttir, S.H., Madsen, M.L., Mayzaud, P., MüllerNavarra, D., Nichols, P.D., Paffenhöfer, G.A., Pond, D., Saito, H., Stübing, D., Virtue, P., 2007. Perspectives on marine zooplankton lipids. Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. 64, 1628-1639. https://doi.org/10.1139/f07-122.
Khalil, M., Doo, S.S., Stuhr, M., Westphal, H., 2022. Ocean warming amplifies the effects of ocean acidification on skeletal mineralogy and microstructure in the asterinid starfish Aquilonastra yairi. J. Mar. Sci. Eng. 10, 1065. https://doi.org/10.3390/ jmse10081065.
Khalil, M., Doo, S.S., Stuhr, M., Westphal, H., 2023. Long-term physiological responses to combined ocean acidification and warming show energetic trade-offs in an asterinid starfish. Coral Reefs 42, 845-858. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00338-023-02388-2.
Khalil, M., Stuhr, M., Kunzmann, A., Westphal, H., 2024a. Ca-ATPase and Mg-ATPase enzyme activities of the tropical-subtropical starfish Aquilonastra yairi under ocean acidification and warming in the laboratory. PANGAEA. https://doi.pangaea.de/10. 1594/PANGAEA. 965905.
Khalil, M., Stuhr, M., Kunzmann, A., Westphal, H., 2024b. Fatty acid composition of the tropical-subtropical starfish Aquilonastra yairi under ocean acidification and warming in the laboratory. PANGAEA. https://doi.pangaea.de/10.1594/PANGAEA. 965902.

Khalil, M., Stuhr, M., Kunzmann, A., Westphal, H., 2024c. Total lipids of the tropicalsubtropical starfish Aquilonastra yairi under ocean acidification and warming in the laboratory. PANGAEA. https://doi.pangaea.de/10.1594/PANGAEA. 965904.
Kolbuk, D., Di Giglio, S., M’Zoudi, S., Dubois, P., Stolarski, J., Gorzelak, P., 2020. Effects of seawater $\mathrm{Mg}^{2+} / \mathrm{Ca}^{2+}$ ratio and diet on the biomineralization and growth of sea urchins and the relevance of fossil echinoderms to paleoenvironmental reconstructions. Geobiology 18, 710-724. https://doi.org/10.1111/gbi. 12409.
Kroeker, K.J., Kordas, R.L., Crim, R., Hendriks, I.E., Ramajo, L., Singh, G.S., Duarte, C.M., Gattuso, J.P., 2013. Impacts of ocean acidification on marine organisms: quantifying sensitivities and interaction with warming. Glob. Chang. Biol. 19, 1884-1896. https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb. 12179.
Lang, B.J., Donelson, J.M., Bairos-Novak, K.R., Wheeler, C.R., Caballes, C.F., Uthicke, S., Pratchett, M.S., 2023. Impacts of ocean warming on echinoderms: a meta-analysis. Ecol. Evol. 13, e10307 https://doi.org/10.1002/ece3.10307.
Laurent, J., Venn, A., Tambutte, E., Ganot, P., Allemand, D., Tambutte, S., 2014. Regulation of intracellular pH in cnidarians: response to acidosis in Anemonia viridis. FEBS J. 281, 683-695. https://doi.org/10.1111/febs.12614.
Leung, J.Y.S., Zhang, S., Connell, S.D., 2022. Is ocean acidification really a threat to marine calcifiers? A systematic review and meta-analysis of 980+ studies spanning two decades. Small 18, e2107407. https://doi.org/10.1002/smll.202107407.
Levene, H., 1960. Robust tests for equality of variances. In: Olkin, I. (Ed.), Contributions to Probability and Statistics. Stanford University Press, Palo Alto, CA, pp. 278-292.
Lischka, S., Greenacre, M.J., Riebesell, U., Graeve, M., 2022. Membrane lipid sensitivity to ocean warming and acidification poses a severe threat to Arctic pteropods. Front. Mar. Sci. 9, 920163 https://doi.org/10.3389/fmars.2022.920163.
Maia, S., Marques, S.C., Dupont, S., Neves, M., Pinto, H.J., Reis, J., Leandro, S.M., 2022. Effects of ocean acidification and warming on the development and biochemical responses of juvenile shrimp Palaemon elegans (Rathke, 1837). Mar. Environ. Res. 176, 105580 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marenvres.2022.105580.
Matoo, O.B., Lannig, G., Bock, C., Sokolova, I.M., 2021. Temperature but not ocean acidification affects energy metabolism and enzyme activities in the blue mussel, Mytilus edulis. Ecol. Evol. 11, 3366-3379. https://doi.org/10.1002/ece3.7289.
Matson, P.G., Yu, P.C., Sewell, M.A., Hofmann, G.E., 2012. Development under elevated $p \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ conditions does not affect lipid utilization and protein content in early lifehistory stages of the purple sea urchin, Strongylocentrotus purpuratus. Biol. Bull. 223, 312-327. https://doi.org/10.1086/BBLv223n3p312.
McLaren, E.J., Byrne, M., 2022. The effect of ocean acidification on the escape behaviour of the sea star Parvulastra exigua to its sea star predator Meridiastra calcar. J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol. 555, 151779 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jembe.2022.151779.

Melzner, F., Mark, F.C., Seibel, B.A., Tomanek, L., 2020. Ocean acidification and coastal marine invertebrates: tracking $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ effects from seawater to the cell. Ann. Rev. Mar. Sci. 12, 499-523. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-marine-010419-010658.
Murphy, D.J., 2001. The biogenesis and functions of lipid bodies in animals, plants and microorganisms. Prog. Lipid Res. 40, 325-438. https://doi.org/10.1016/s0163-7827 (01)00013-3.

Nakamura, M.T., Nara, T.Y., 2004. Structure, function, and dietary regulation of $\Delta 6, \Delta 5$, and $\Delta 9$ desaturases. Annu. Rev. Nutr. 24, 345-376. https://doi.org/10.1146/ annurev.nutr.24.121803.063211.
Nguyen, H.D., Byrne, M., 2014. Early benthic juvenile Parvulastra exigua (Asteroidea) are tolerant to extreme acidification and warming in its intertidal habitat. J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol. 453, 36-42. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jembe.2013.12.007.
O'Loughlin, P.M., Rowe, F.W.E., 2006. A systematic revision of the asterinid genus Aquilonastra O’Loughlin, 2004 (Echinodermata: Asteroidea). Mem. Mus. Vic. 63, 257-287. https://doi.org/10.24199/j.mmv.2006.63.18.
Pan, T.C., Applebaum, S.L., Manahan, D.T., 2015. Experimental ocean acidification alters the allocation of metabolic energy. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A. 112, 4696-4701. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas. 1416967112.
Parrish, C.C., 2013. Lipids in marine ecosystems. Int. Sch. Res. Not. 2013, 604045 https://doi.org/10.5402/2013/604045.
Peng, C., Zhao, X., Liu, S., Shi, W., Han, Y., Guo, C., Peng, X., Chai, X., Liu, G., 2017. Ocean acidification alters the burrowing behaviour, $\mathrm{Ca}^{2+} / \mathrm{Mg}^{2+}$-ATPase activity, metabolism, and gene expression of a bivalve species, Sinonovacula constricta. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 575, 107-117. https://doi.org/10.3354/meps12224.
Petersen, O.H., Verkhratsky, A., 2016. Calcium and ATP control multiple vital functions. Philos. Trans. R. Soc. Lond. B. Biol. Sci. 371, 20150418 https://doi.org/10.1098/ rstb.2015.0418.
Peterson, R.A., 2021. Finding optimal normalizing transformations via bestNormalize. R. J. 13, 310-329. https://doi.org/10.32614/rj-2021-041.

Pörtner, H., 2008. Ecosystem effects of ocean acidification in times of ocean warming: a physiologist's view. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 373, 203-217. https://doi.org/10.3354/ meps07768.
Prazeres, M., Pandolfi, J.M., 2016. Effects of elevated temperature on the shell density of the large benthic foraminifera Amphistegina lobifera. J. Eukaryot. Microbiol. 63, 786-793. https://doi.org/10.1111/jeu.12325.
Prazeres, M., Uthicke, S., Pandolfi, J.M., 2015. Ocean acidification induces biochemical and morphological changes in the calcification process of large benthic foraminifera. Proc. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci. 282, 20142782 https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2014.2782.
R Core Team, 2023. R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing. R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria.
Ramesh, K., Hu, M.Y., Thomsen, J., Bleich, M., Melzner, F., 2017. Mussel larvae modify calcifying fluid carbonate chemistry to promote calcification. Nat. Commun. 8, 1709. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-017-01806-8.
Rossoll, D., Bermudez, R., Hauss, H., Schulz, K.G., Riebesell, U., Sommer, U., Winder, M., 2012. Ocean acidification-induced food quality deterioration constrains trophic transfer. PloS One 7, e34737. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0034737.
Safuan, C.D.M., Samshuri, M.A., Jaafar, S.N., Tan, C.H., Bachok, Z., 2021. Physiological response of shallow-water hard coral Acropora digitifera to heat stress via fatty acid composition. Front. Mar. Sci. 8, 715167 https://doi.org/10.3389/ fmars.2021.715167.
Sampaio, E., Santos, C., Rosa, I.C., Ferreira, V., Portner, H.O., Duarte, C.M., Levin, L.A., Rosa, R., 2021. Impacts of hypoxic events surpass those of future ocean warming and acidification. Nat. Ecol. Evol. 5, 311-321. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41559-020-01370-3.
Schalkhausser, B., Bock, C., Stemmer, K., Brey, T., Pörtner, H.-O., Lannig, G., 2012. Impact of ocean acidification on escape performance of the king scallop, Pecten maximus, from Norway. Mar. Biol. 160, 1995-2006. https://doi.org/10.1007/ s00227-012-2057-8.
Schmitz, G., Ecker, J., 2008. The opposing effects of n-3 and n-6 fatty acids. Prog. Lipid Res. 47, 147-155. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.plipres.2007.12.004.
Schwaner, C., Barbosa, M., Schwemmer, T.G., Pales Espinosa, E., Allam, B., 2023. Increased food resources help eastern oyster mitigate the negative impacts of coastal acidification. Animals 13. https://doi.org/10.3390/ani13071161.
Shapiro, S.S., Wilk, M.B., 1965. An analysis of variance test for normality (complete samples). Biometrika 52, 591-611. https://doi.org/10.2307/2333709.
Sinensky, M., 1974. Homeoviscous adaptation-a homeostatic process that regulates the viscosity of membrane lipids in Escherichia coli. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A. 71, 522-525. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.71.2.522.
Smale, D.A., Wernberg, T., Oliver, E.C.J., Thomsen, M., Harvey, B.P., Straub, S.C., Burrows, M.T., Alexander, L.V., Benthuysen, J.A., Donat, M.G., Feng, M., Hobday, A. J., Holbrook, N.J., Perkins-Kirkpatrick, S.E., Scannell, H.A., Sen Gupta, A., Payne, B. L., Moore, P.J., 2019. Marine heatwaves threaten global biodiversity and the provision of ecosystem services. Nat. Clim. Chang. 9, 306-312. https://doi.org/ 10.1038/s41558-019-0412-1.

Smith, A.M., Clark, D.E., Lamare, M.D., Winter, D.J., Byrne, M., 2016. Risk and resilience: variations in magnesium in echinoid skeletal calcite. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 561, 1-16. https://doi.org/10.3354/meps11908.
Sokolova, I.M., Frederich, M., Bagwe, R., Lannig, G., Sukhotin, A.A., 2012. Energy homeostasis as an integrative tool for assessing limits of environmental stress tolerance in aquatic invertebrates. Mar. Environ. Res. 79, 1-15. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.marenvres.2012.04.003.

Somero, G.N., 1978. Temperature adaptation of enzymes: biological optimization through structure-function compromises. Annu. Rev. Ecol. Syst. 9, 1-29. https://doi. org/10.1146/annurev.es.09.110178.000245.

Stanley-Samuelson, D.W., 1987. Physiological roles of prostaglandins and other eicosanoids in invertebrates. Biol. Bull. 173, 92-109. https://doi.org/10.2307/ 1541865.

Strahl, J., Francis, D.S., Doyle, J., Humphrey, C., Fabricius, K.E., 2016. Biochemical responses to ocean acidification contrast between tropical corals with high and low abundances at volcanic carbon dioxide seeps. ICES J. Mar. Sci. 73, 897-909. https:// doi.org/10.1093/icesjms/fsv194.
Stumpp, M., Hu, M.Y., 2017. pH regulation and excretion in echinoderms. In: Weihrauch, D., O'Donnell, M. (Eds.), Acid-Base Balance and Nitrogen Excretion in Invertebrates. Springer, pp. 261-273.
Tocher, D.R., 2010. Metabolism and functions of lipids and fatty acids in teleost fish. Rev. Fish. Sci. 11, 107-184. https://doi.org/10.1080/713610925.
Towle, E.K., Enochs, I.C., Langdon, C., 2015. Threatened Caribbean coral is able to mitigate the adverse effects of ocean acidification on calcification by increasing feeding rate. PloS One 10, e0123394. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal. pone. 0123394.
Tresguerres, M., 2016. Novel and potential physiological roles of vacuolar-type $\mathrm{H}^{+}$ATPase in marine organisms. J. Exp. Biol. 219, 2088-2097. https://doi.org/ 10.1242/jeb. 128389.

Valles-Regino, R., Tate, R., Kelaher, B., Savins, D., Dowell, A., Benkendorff, K., 2015. Ocean warming and $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$-induced acidification impact the lipid content of a marine predatory gastropod. Mar. Drugs 13, 6019-6037. https://doi.org/10.3390/ md13106019.
Venables, W.N., Ripley, B.D., 2002. Modern Applied Statistics with S, 4th ed. Springer, New York.
Vijayavel, K., Gopalakrishnan, S., Balasubramanian, M.P., 2007. Sublethal effect of silver and chromium in the green mussel Perna viridis with reference to alterations in oxygen uptake, filtration rate and membrane bound ATPase system as biomarkers. Chemosphere 69, 979-986. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2007.05.011.

Wahltinez, S.J., Kroll, K.J., Behringer, D.C., Arnold, J.E., Whitaker, B., Newton, A.L., Edmiston, K., Hewson, I., Stacy, N.I., 2023. Common sea star (Asterias rubens) coelomic fluid changes in response to short-term exposure to environmental stressors. Fishes 8. https://doi.org/10.3390/fishes8010051.
Walther, K., Sartoris, F.J., Bock, C., Pörtner, H.O., 2009. Impact of anthropogenic ocean acidification on thermal tolerance of the spider crab Hyas araneus. Biogeosciences 6, 2207-2215. https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-6-2207-2009.
Wang, Z.J., Liang, C.L., Li, G.M., Yu, C.Y., Yin, M., 2007. Stearic acid protects primary cultured cortical neurons against oxidative stress. Acta Pharmacol. Sin. 28, 315-326. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1745-7254.2007.00512.x.
Weber, J.N., 1969. The incorporation of magnesium into the skeletal calcites of echinoderms. Am. J. Sci. 267, 537-566. https://doi.org/10.2475/ajs.267.5.537.
Wickham, H., 2016. ggplot2: Elegant Graphics for Data Analysis. Springer-Verlag, New York.
Yoon, D.S., Byeon, E., Kim, D.H., Lee, M.C., Shin, K.H., Hagiwara, A., Park, H.G., Lee, J. S., 2022. Effects of temperature and combinational exposures on lipid metabolism in aquatic invertebrates. Comp. Biochem. Physiol. Part C Toxicol. Pharmacol. 262, 109449 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cbpc.2022.109449.
Yu, H., Zhang, C., Gao, Q., Dong, S., Ye, Z., Tian, X., 2016. Impact of water temperature on the growth and fatty acid profiles of juvenile sea cucumber Apostichopus japonicus (Selenka). J. Therm. Biol. 60, 155-161. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. jtherbio.2016.07.011.
Zeebe, R.E., 2012. History of seawater carbonate chemistry, atmospheric $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$, and ocean acidification. Annu. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci. 40, 141-165. https://doi.org/10.1146/ annurev-earth-042711-105521.
Zhuang, X.Y., Zhang, Y.H., Xiao, A.F., Zhang, A.H., Fang, B.S., 2022. Key enzymes in fatty acid synthesis pathway for bioactive lipids biosynthesis. Front. Nutr. 9, 851402 https://doi.org/10.3389/fnut.2022.851402.
Zhukova, N.V., 2022. Fatty acids of echinoderms: diversity, current applications and future opportunities. Mar. Drugs 21, 21. https://doi.org/10.3390/md21010021.


[^0]:    * Corresponding author at: Leibniz Centre for Tropical Marine Research (ZMT), Fahrenheitstraße 6, 28359 Bremen, Germany.

    E-mail address: munawar.khalil@leibniz-zmt.de (M. Khalil).

